**Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board**

**Executive Leadership Committee Meeting Minutes**

**June 13, 2019 ~ 8:30 a.m.**

The meeting of the Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board Executive Leadership Committee was held on June 13, 2019 located at Phoenix City Hall, 200 W. Washington St., 20th Floor, Phoenix, AZ 85003.

**Committee Members Present:**

Nick DePorter (Chair)

Audrey Bohanan (Vice Chair)

Nick Bielinski

Michael Hale

Michelle Jameson

Jesus Love

Bethany Woodard

**Committee Members Absent:**

Daniel Barajas

**Public Attendees:**

Diane Nakagawa

Kerri Barnes

Stan Flowers

Kweilin Waller

Silvia Valadez

Rob Stenson

Christina Edwards (PBWDB Liaison)

LaSetta Hogans (PBWDB Executive Director)

Action items taken are noted in **bold** print.

1. **Call to Order**

PBWDB Chair Nick DePorter called the June 13, 2019 Phoenix Business and Workforce Development (PBWD) Board Executive Leadership Committee (ELC) Meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. Roll call was completed, and quorum was met with seven members in attendance.

1. **Approval of Minutes for April 11, 2019 and April 25, 2019 Meetings:**

A. ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan made a **motion to approve minutes for**

 **the April 11, 2019 meeting** and ELC member Nick Bielinski seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Michael Hale, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

B. ELC member Nick Bielinski made a **motion to approve minutes for the**

 **April 25, 2019 meeting** and ELC member Michelle Jameson seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Audrey Bohanan, Michael Hale, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**3. Consent Item: PBWD Board Membership Reappointments**

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan made a **motion to approve the consent item** and ELC member Michael Hale seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**4. PBWD Board Chairman Update**

A. PBWD Board Chair, Nick DePorter, thanked everyone for their support during the past year. Chair DePorter has enjoyed working with the ELC and looks forward to continuing his service through the Chair Emeritus role and participation in his assigned committee.

 **5. PBWDB Committee Updates**

**Advancing Youth Workforce Committee (AYWC):** AYWC Vice Chair, Bethany Woodard, stated the committee has made a lot of progress recently. The committee reviewed the AYWC Scorecard Year Two Goals and marked the status of several items green. Some existing goals and action items were changed or reworded on the Year Two Scorecard.

The next AYWC meeting is scheduled for June 25, 2019, and the committee will be reviewing the facilitated Youth Provider discussion results, which occurred a few weeks ago. In an effort to strengthen the relationship between the board, program staff and youth providers, the AYWC will look at results that are in the committee’s purview and recommend ways to address some of the issues raised by the youth providers.

AYWC Vice Chair Woodard stated that all four youth providers sit at the table with the committee during the AYWC meetings and are encouraged to offer input and feedback as needed.

AYWC Vice Chair Woodard shared that the AYWC created a Youth Ambassador Workgroup to look at adding two youth memberships to the committee through a work experience (WEX). The goal is to identify youth who are enrolled in WIOA and who want to use their voice and experience to help guide the development of youth services and program delivery.

**Business Engagement Committee (BEC):** BEC Chair, Michael Hale, stated the committee had their meeting last month, with 100% participation and high engagement from members. After review of the action or goal in detail, the committee found several items that were to be marked complete on their Year Two Scorecard. After a rich discussion, the committee realized that some goals needed realignment, and in doing so, made the goal green or complete.

BEC Chair Hale indicated the Bagels and Business (B&B) event was very successful and the committee will to look at methods to continue building momentum. The next B&B event will target C-Suite individuals, or decision makes. The goal is to have the “decision makers” attend the B&B event.

PBWDB Chair Nick DePorter shared it would be a great idea to leverage Mayor Gallego as a speaker at a B&B event, as she has tremendous attendance draw and would attract C-Suite individuals.

**Continuous Improvement Committee (CIC):** CIC Chair, Audrey Bohanan, stated their committee meetings always start with reviewing the Scorecard. The committee worked through each goal on the Year Two Scorecard, making edits to ensure they are capturing the work that is being done.

The CIC spent time reviewing the One Stop Operator monthly report and the graphs in those reports are now showing a numerical value, showing how many people are answering a specific question. The CIC feels confident they are getting the level of data they need to accurately and effectively evaluate programs and services delivered at the Job Centers.

In terms of performance measures, the CIC has been reaching out to subject matter experts and inviting them to committee meetings to explain the data, how it’s captured and what it truly means. The committee wants to measure data that has value, is accurate, and easily understandable.

CIC Vice Chair, Nick Bielinski, share the committee is trying to capture data through surveys and have been focusing on survey responses. A lot of time has been spent on formulating surveys, getting survey questions correct, and they have a small sample size of survey results. Now, the goal is to increase the number of survey responses

The CIC will explore retention efforts moving forward. Once ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix gets someone a job, why do they no longer have that job six months to a year after exiting the WIOA program?

**Service Delivery Committee (SDC):** SDC Chair, Michelle Jameson, stated their committee reviewed the Scorecard Year Two goals at the previous meeting. The SDC will be reviewing Year Three goals at their meeting today.

The SDC is looking to fill the Vice Chair role and will be discussing this at today’s meeting. SDC members Ali Gamero-Hernandez and Jan Davis are eligible to fill the Vice Chair role of the SDC. Final appointment to the Vice Chair position is made by the PBWD Board Chair.

SDC Chair Jameson shared that Goodwill staff recently attended the National Association of Workforce Development Professionals (NAWDP) conference and gave a presentation on Job Center redesign at the last SDC meeting. The remodeled job centers in Spokane, Washington are more welcoming and less institutionalized. The presentation contained before and after photos of the job center that was redesigned.

SDC Chair Jameson stated the SDC will not hold a meeting in July and will reconvene in August.

**6. ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix Policy Review and Draft Approval**

 The following Draft Policies were reviewed and approved by the ELC and will be forwarded to the Phoenix Business and Workforce Development Board for final approval:

1. Sec.400-403 Data Integrity and the Customer Participation Cycle
2. Sec. 400-407 Performance Measures
3. Sec. 400-413 Incentives
4. Sec. 200-206 Workforce Preparation Activities - Job Readiness

ELC member Michael Hale **motioned to approve Policies A-D to the PBWD Board for approval**. ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**7. PBWDB Application Review and Recommendation**The Executive Leadership Committee (ELC) reviewed the following applications and resumes for PBWDB membership.

 A. An application and resume were received from **Beth Salazar, Planned**

 **Giving Manager, Southwest Autism Research and Resource Center**

 **(SARRC)** for a vacant Community Based Organization position on the

 PBWD Board. This applicant is recommended by PBWDB Vice Chair

 Audrey Bohannan.

B. An application and resume were received from **Melissa Trujillo,**

 **President/CEO and Co-Founder Be a Leader Foundation** for a vacant

 Community Based Organization position on the PBWD Board. This

 applicant is recommended by PBWDB member Michael Hale.

C. An application and resume were received from **Maureen Funkhouser,**

 **Manager of Learning and Development, Salt River Project (SRP)**, for

 a vacant Business position on the PBWD Board. This applicant is

 recommended by PBWDB Chairman Nick DePorter.

D. An application and resume were received from **Steven Cramer, Vice**

 **President of Operations, Newbridge Technology Solutions LLC,** for a

 vacant Business position on the PBWD Board. This applicant is

 recommended by PBWDB member Michael Hale.

ELC member Jesus Love **motioned to forward applications A-D** to the City of Phoenix Mayor for review and possible appointment to the PBWDB. ELC member Bethany Woodard seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Audrey Bohanan, Nick Bielinski, Michael Hale, and Michelle Jameson.

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**8. Procurement Plan – Program Year 19/20**

City of Phoenix Procurement Manager, Gretchen Wolfe, and Contract Specialist, Melissa Magallanez, gave a presentation on the WIOA procurement plan for program year 19/20. The presentation included a review of the procurement-related expenditures for program year 18/19.

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan **motioned to approve the Procurement Plan for program year 19/20**. ELC member Nick Bielinski seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Michael Hale, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**9. PBWD Board Strategic Plan ELC Scorecard – Year Two Goals**

A. *Goal 3.2 – Create a universal cross-partner referral process including leveraging technology for standardized referral forms.*

During the discussion around Goal 3.2, ELC member Jesus Love stated he wants to demonstrate the Yuma Client Referral System (CRS) at the next ELC meeting. ELC member Love wants to make progress on the client referral system, and is currently looking for a server, and will be doing a pilot of the system with a few users.

 PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans stated the issue is finding a state-wide client referral system, with all partners in agreement to use the system and then identify who will manage the system. The Yuma Client Referral System works because all the workforce system partners in Yuma have agreed to utilize the system.

PBWDB Executive Director Hogans shared that our One Stop Operator (OSO) is tasked with working on a client referral system through their contract. The OSO has had staff turnover that has affected progress on the client referral system, but with new staff on board, they are currently working on the CRS again.

ELC member Michael Hale suggested putting together a proof of concept discussion at the next board meeting to review the client referral system that Yuma has in place to move us in the right direction. ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohannan agreed to have the proof of concept presentation at the next ELC meeting in August.

ELC member Michael Hale **motioned to have a proof of concept discussion on the Yuma Client Referral System at the ELC meeting on August 8, 2019.** ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

B. Goal 3.3 - *Continue supporting regular Workforce Collaborative meetings and events.*

Business Services Supervisor, Rob Stenson, shared that The Workforce Collaborative (TWC) is still occurring, and staff attend the event from the Business Services Team. A request to have information shared with the PBWDB was made and in the future. Currently, these updates are shared at the BEC meetings. The ELC agreed to continue the practice of sharing TWC updates at the BEC meetings only.

After discussion with the ELC members, and input from Rob Stenson, Business Services Supervisor, Goal 3.3 will be moved over to the Business Engagement Committee’s Scorecard for Year Three.

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan **motioned to move Goal 3.3 to the Business Engagement Committee Scorecard Year Three**. ELC member Nick Bielinski seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Michael Hale, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

C. Goal 5.2 - *Include standing agenda item for board/committee meetings for members to share how they have engaged their network as workforce ambassadors.*

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan suggested removing this goal as the PBWDB no longer has ambassadors. The current practice is: if board members attend an event, they take a photo, send it to board staff and board staff includes the photo in the Board Member Engagement PowerPoint slide shown at the PBWDB meetings.

ELC member Nick Bielinski suggested having a Board Member Engagement newsletter twice a year, that highlights what board members are doing in the community. The newsletter can also highlight board member attendance and a recap of the previous six months.

ELC member Michael Hale suggested taking Nick Bielinski’s newsletter idea an expanding it to show the public the work that board members are doing. This will prompt people to look at how they can be involved with the Board and the work board members do.

ELC member Bethany Woodard suggested having a PBWDB LinkedIn page to share the work Board members are doing. Executive Director Hogans shared that Christina Edwards, PBWDB Liaison, and herself currently share photos of events that Board members attend to LinkedIn, with permission, and tag the Board member in the post. Executive Director Hogans shared that we can create a LinkedIn page, but we need to seriously consider the content of the page and how we drive traffic to the page.

ELC member Michael Hale stated that ultimately, we need to be able to measure success. Because of our efforts, what are we achieving? What is the return on investment?

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohannan stated that we need to identify how PBWDB members can engage with the community to educate them about the workforce opportunities, tools and resources that are available. How can Board members share ARIZONA@WORK program and services within their business communities?

Board Liaison, Christina Edwards, suggested adding this goal to the ELC year three scorecard for further discussion.

After discussion by the ELC members, a recommendation was made to change Goal 5.2 to green.

ELC member Michael Hale **motioned to change the status of Goal 5.2 from yellow to green.** ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michelle Jameson, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

D. PBWD Board Liaison, Christina Edwards, shared that Goal 7.3 is currently red, however this goal is included on the ELC Year Three Scorecard. As the year two scorecard is being closed-out, do committee members want to change the status of 7.3 to a color other than red?

ELC member Michelle Jameson shared that funding opportunities is a big responsibility and should be shared with other committees and City of Phoenix staff.

Human Services Department, Deputy Director, Kweilin Waller shared that youth program staff strategically look for funding opportunities to fund the summer youth programs JEM and RISE. Deputy Director Waller shared that many corporations do not want to give money directly to the City of Phoenix. This presents an issue when trying to secure funding and results in program staff working with funders to come up with an alternative solution. Partnerships with nonprofits may be a way around some of these issues, where the city is acting as a “fiscal agent”, but not directly receiving funds.

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan suggested changing the language in 7.3 to state that the Board supports the strategic efforts to secure funding for service gaps and assist in identify opportunities for funding.

After discussion by the ELC members, a recommendation was made to change the language in Goal 7, Strategies 7.3 to: *What programs are underfunded; look for opportunities to increase funding.*

The tactic associated with strategy 7.3 will be changed to: *Perform strategic search to identify funding to fill gaps in service.*

ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan **motioned to approve the changes to Goal 7 on the ELC Scorecard Year Two and add the updated Goal 7 to the ELC Scorecard Year Three.** ELC member Michelle Jameson seconded.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michael Hale, Jesus Love and Bethany Woodard

**Opposed:** None

**Motion passed unanimously**

**Bethany Woodard left the meeting at 10:26 a.m.**

**10. PBWD Board Retreat**

 PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared that the Board Retreat has been pushed to a later date in the year. There are many complex board governance agreements that need to be completed by November of this year. Once a Board Consultant has been hired in October/November, we will work with the consultant to create a retreat using the list of agenda items the board members previously provided. Board retreat sponsorship opportunities are still available for companies that are interested.

**11. Arizona Department of Economic Security, Department of Labor Monitoring Report**

PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans reviewed the Arizona Department of Economic Security monitoring report, completed by the U.S. Department of Labor (DOL). Executive Director Hogans shared appreciation to have PBWDB members and staff meet with the DOL during their visit to Arizona.

Executive Director Hogans noted that the City of Phoenix was cited as having a Best Practice for locating their ARIZONA@WORK comprehensive and affiliate job centers in areas with the highest need populations. Executive Director Hogans encouraged PBWD Board members to visit the Marcos de Niza affiliate site in Phoenix to see the partnership between the city’s Housing Department and ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix.

 U.S. DOL was very impressed with the ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix youth provider locations and job centers when visiting those locations in person. Out of the twelve local workforce boards, DOL cited only the City of Phoenix workforce board, and Pinal County workforce board, as knowing the amount of their WIOA budgets and funding allocations.

Executive Director Hogans shared that some of the observations by DOL for the City of Phoenix were not a surprise, such as needing to have a shared local governance agreement between the Mayor and the PBWDB. And needing an agreement between the Community and Economic Development Department and Human Services Department to provide career services for the city. These agreements are currently being developed, or will be developed, by board staff and will be complete by November 2019. The documented agreements will be presented to the PBWDB for approval when appropriate.

Executive Director Hogans shared the City of Phoenix moved staff a year ago to ensure firewalls are in place and conflict of interest is avoided. Now, we need to document those changes into the agreements previously mentioned.

Additionally, Executive Director Hogans shared that City of Phoenix was cited by DOL as being compliant to the Sunshine Provision, which mandates that public board meeting agendas are posted publicly, with the corresponding results, within a specified time frame.

Finally, Executive Director Hogans shared that the Infrastructure Funding Agreement (IFA) costs, as outlined in the workforce system partner Memorandum of Understanding, was presented to DOL during the monitoring visit. DOL did not fully understand the IFA template that was provided and DOL did not understand that all system partners are contributing to the IFA, through direct funding or in-kind services. Executive Director Hogans spoke with AZ Department of Economic Security and reiterated that the information on in-kind contributions from system partners was included in the IFA and that we are currently working on including contributions from our Title II Adult Education partner as well.

PBWDB Chair Nick DePorter thanked the PBWD Board members who spoke with DOL on the Board’s behalf: Michelle Jameson, Audrey Bohanan, Ali Gamero-Hernandez and Nick Bielinski. Chair DePorter also thanked the PBWDB Executive Director, LaSetta Hogans and PBWD Board Liaison, Christina Edwards, for their hard work in preparing for the DOL visit.

**12. WIOA Program Year 19/20 Funding Allocations**

PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans shared the WIOA program year funding allocations for 2019/2020. Executive Director Hogans shared the state received over 80 million dollars in funding for program year 19/20. The City of Phoenix received around 12 million, which is an increase of 1.3 million over last program year. The handout that was shared with the committee highlights the increases for each program: Adult, Dislocated Worker, Rapid Response and Youth.

**13. Job Center Certification Status Update**

PBWD Board Liaison, Christina Edwards, shared the Job Center Certification process is complete and all ARIZONA@WORK City of Phoenix comprehensive and affiliate job centers are certified.

There are three additional job centers to be certified, Aeroterra Affiliate Site, CPLC @ Desert Sky Mall Affiliate Site and the South Job Center. The Job Center Certification Workgroup will meet mid-August to begin discussions on the certification plan for each site.

**14. Matters for Future Discussion**

ELC member Michelle Jameson shared that she is participating in meetings with the Maricopa County Workforce Development Board (MCWDB) Regionalism and Sustainability Workgroup on regional strategic planning efforts with the City of Phoenix. PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans has also been participating in these meetings. ELC Member Jameson will continue to update the PBWDB on the regionalism efforts.

PBWDB Executive Director LaSetta Hogans will ask the MCWDB to come and present on their regional strategic planning efforts with the ELC. Executive Director Hogans thanked Michelle Jameson for doing a great job in continuing to participate in the reginal meetings with Maricopa County.

**15. Call to the Public and Open Discussion**

Stan Flowers, Workforce Program Manager, shared details around the Integrated Service Delivery celebration that took place on Friday, June 7, 2019. The event was a big success and staff appreciated being recognized.

**16. Adjournment**

 **A motion to adjourn the meeting was made at 10:48 a.m.** by ELC Vice Chair Audrey Bohanan seconded by ELC member Jesus Love.

**Approved:** Nick DePorter, Nick Bielinski, Michelle Jameson and Michael Hale.

**Opposed:** None

**All were in favor and the meeting adjourned at 10:48 a.m.**